Performance Management Training for Supervisors
Facilities Human Resources and Diversity Council
Cornell University Facilities Services
Fall 2012
I got a text message from our boss.

“Keep up wrk”

What does that mean?

You just got your annual performance review.

© Scott Adams, Inc./Dist. by UFS, Inc.
WHY ARE WE HERE?

1. Further goals of career advancement for all staff
2. Highlight relationship between PD and Diversity Initiatives
3. Gain feedback about current process
4. Set consistent expectations of performance mgmt. for division
5. Discuss what you can do to promote diversity and inclusion
6. Share new tools and resources for you
Introductions

- Name and department
- One word description of your sentiment (positive or negative) about the current performance management process.
The State of Affairs at FS
2012 Employee Survey Results

% with negative view

- I am NOT able to provide feedback about my supervisor's performance: 60% (Facilities), 65% (University)
- I am NOT satisfied with my opportunities for promotion: 56% (Facilities), 63% (University)
- My performance reviews DO NOT provide useful feedback: 35% (Facilities), 33% (University)
- My supervisor DOES NOT support my professional development: 26% (Facilities), 34% (University)
- My supervisor DOES NOT fairly evaluate my performance: 28% (Facilities), 24% (University)
- My Performance reviews are NOT conducted regularly: 13% (Facilities), 15% (University)
• about 3% of all FS staff are promoted each fiscal year
• in FY11, only white staff were promoted
• in FY12, all but 1 promotions were to white staff
Succession Planning

Facilities Services
Possible staff turnover
Bands G, H, I (~100 employees)

- Normal turnover approximately 6%
- # of staff at average retirement age of 60

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Normal turnover</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>35</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Average retirement age of 60</td>
<td>33</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• Only about 25% of performance reviews were submitted on time in the 2011-2012 review cycle.

• 18 employees have not had a performance review in the 2011-2012 review cycle.
Performance Rating Calibration

Division of Facilities Services
Performance Ratings - Non Union Employees

How does this create challenges for you as supervisors?
How does this create challenges for your direct reports?
Salary Improvement Program

*a pay for performance compensation system*

Sample recommended distribution correlated to pay based on a 3% pool

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Performance Rating</th>
<th>Fully Achieves Expectations</th>
<th>Frequently Exceeds Expectations</th>
<th>Consistently Exceeds Expectations</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>% of staff</td>
<td>~ 55% of staff</td>
<td>~ 25% of staff</td>
<td>~ 15% of staff</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recommended pay increase</td>
<td>2.50%</td>
<td>3.25%</td>
<td>4.25%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
A tactical framework that senior leaders, department heads, and the Cornell community can use to achieve the excellence derived from full engagement and advancement of institutional diversity.
The satisfiers include:
- Getting to do what I do best
- Caring managers and supervisors
- Positive co-worker relationships
- Adequate resources to do my job
- Trust and treatment by upper management
- Opportunities to learn and grow
- Clear expectations about the work requirements
- Competitive compensation, reward, and recognition

The dis-satisfiers include:
- Prejudice and discrimination for arbitrary reasons
- Poor career development opportunity
- Poor work environment or climate
- Low organizational savvy on the people issues
- Pressure to conform or assimilate
TOWARD NEW DESTINATIONS
University-wide Commitment to Diversity

- Composition
  - Diversify demographics; improve pipelines; reduce attrition
- Inclusion
  - Intercultural competency; institutionalize flexibility
- Engagement
  - Awareness, participation & interaction valuing differences
- Achievement
  - Career, professional & personal development for all staff

President Skorton is holding each VP & Dean accountable to 5 goals in their Annual Reports
FS GOAL: ACHIEVEMENT
Professional & Personal Development for All Staff

- Promote opportunities for individual development, particularly for under-represented staff
- Increase the diversity of participants in leadership training, conferences, rewards and recognitions, strategic planning, and job rotational assignments.
- Improve existing processes that will contribute to opportunities for career development for all staff

Metrics of success
- Supervisor Training Participation
- Timely submission of PD
- Staff participation in Leadership/Professional development opportunities
- Promotions
- SIP award distribution
- Employee satisfaction rating
Guess the Acronym

• HR
• PD
• SPD
• TR
• IDP
• HHDS
• PIP
• FSAP
The Performance Review Process
Before – What to Expect

Support
Preparedness
Timely communication

Action Items
• Set up meeting with employee to ask employee to complete self-evaluation, review and edit job description, and complete individual development plan. Communicate deadline.
• Employee prepares self-evaluation and submits to supervisor.
• Discuss clear expectations about what ratings mean.
• **OPTIONAL:** Discuss gathering feedback from others using Qualtrics survey tool. Develop list collaboratively of who to ask for feedback.
• Review employee's performance review from last year including customer compliments, disciplines, awards, training, certifications, etc.
• Supervisor writes performance review incorporating employee’s contribution.
During – What to Expect

Privacy
Candor
Mutual Respect
Fair and unbiased (not personal)
Security
Dedicated
Seriousness

Action Items
• Discuss self-evaluation, supervisor evaluation, and individual development plan. Reconcile major differences where needed.
• Discuss career goals and definition of ratings.
• Review edits to job description and individual development plan and enhance as needed.
Documentation
Confidentiality
Commitment & Follow up

Action Items
• Both sign final version.
• Supervisor submits typed (not handwritten) performance review to HR by March 31 deadline.
• Check-in about performance and individual development plan goals on at least a quarterly basis.
• HR will send quarterly reminders.
Pre-Performance Dialogue (PD) Feedback Questions - OPTIONAL

Directions: Email the note and questions below to approximately 10 key colleagues, peers, and customers of the staff member to help you, the supervisor, gather constructive feedback regarding the employee’s performance. Gathering this feedback provides the employee more developmental information and the supervisor a well-rounded picture of how that staff member is perceived by others. An online tool is also available to collect this feedback. Ask Human Resources for help setting up an online survey.

Dear ____

It is time to review the past year’s performance for _____. My goal is to gain confidential and constructive feedback from several colleagues and partners to be able to give ______ a well-rounded assessment of his/her performance so he/she can be as successful as possible. To that end, I would very much appreciate it if you would take 10 minutes and respond to the questions below. I will collect this data and present it to _____ as pristinely as possible, although I will not share by whom it was written unless you expressly tell me to do so.

What has he/she done well in the past year?

What opportunities for development might you suggest to increase his/her effectiveness / success?

Please share your perception of how he/she is living the values of the university (integrity, civility, collegiality, initiative, stewardship, and excellence).

Please send your comments back to me via this email by _(date)__. Thank you in advance for your input. It is greatly appreciated.
Staff Position Description (SPD) Review

**Expectation**

1. Annual review of staff and supervisors to discuss and update job description during PD

**Next steps**

2. Submit updates to FS HR for review and classification discussion

**Why?**

3. To ensure SPD is accurate, to set performance expectations, ensure appropriate classification

All job descriptions are available online at the FS Job Descriptions web site.
Individual Development Plans

• Required this year for all staff in FS to be completed as part of the performance dialogue

• Develop tasks/assignments based on employee strengths

• Consider diversity-related training/engagement as an important developmental option

Sample Individual Development Plan
## Talent Management Matrix

### Performance

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>1</th>
<th>2</th>
<th>3</th>
<th>4</th>
<th>5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>May be new in the job. May be in the wrong job/wrong manager.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Give time for development or needs intervention.</td>
<td><strong>Valued talent, capacity for advancement after further potential has been realized.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Look for opportunities for growth and new experiences.</td>
<td><strong>Capacity for immediate advancement. Potential for senior succession.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Look for opportunities to promote. Give top level assignments. Partner with executives. Reward and recognize.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>May be new in job or organization. May have lost pace with the changes in the organization.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Continue orientation. Give time for development. Challenge with clear expectations.</td>
<td><strong>Steady and dependable performers, but capable of more. May not understand changes in the organization.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Challenge, allow opportunities for growth and new experiences.</td>
<td><strong>Capacity for immediate, one level advancement. Consider best track – Individual contributor, project manager, or general manager.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Look for opportunities to expand role and challenge, reward and recognize. Engage in decision making.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Has reached job potential and is underperforming.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Manage performance, set clear improvement plan, or exit organization.</td>
<td><strong>Steady and dependable and have reached career potential.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Engage, challenge, focus and motivate.</td>
<td><strong>Excellent performer; has reached career potential.</strong>&lt;br&gt;<strong>Action:</strong> Engage in training others. Challenge, reward and recognize.</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Career Growth Potential

- **Low**
- **High**
Goal Setting

• Goals should align with university and divisional goals

• Utilize Goal Alignment Worksheet as a template

• Review goals and progress on a quarterly basis

• Consider asking each employee to choose a diversity related goal to accomplish during the year
Goal Alignment

University

- Faculty Excellence
- Educational Excellence
- Excellence in Research, Scholarship, and Creativity
- Excellence in Public Engagement
- Staff Excellence
- Excellence in Organizational Stewardship
- Towards New Destinations

Facilities Services

- Advancing environmental sustainability
- Advancing the stewardship of the built environment and operations to accommodate the university’s mission of teaching, research, and engagement
- Continued stewardship in fiduciary responsibility
- Develop staff excellence and enhance work environment
- Public engagement
- Stewardship of University real property assets

Department and Individual

Department and Individual goals should align with university and facilities goals
Succession Planning

• During performance review discussion, ask staff what they are doing to contribute to the goal of succession planning. For example, what are they doing to...
  • ...train others about their job knowledge?
  • ...share information they know about their position and the university?
  • ...help others develop in their roles?
• Ask who do they see as potential successors for their position and other positions in the department.
• Share what you learn from discussions with your supervisor to help in succession planning efforts.
Performance Improvement Plan

• Required when employee is rated 1 or 2 (non-union) and 1 (union)

• Progressive performance improvement tool.

• To help staff member understand expectations and set improvement goals.

• Involvement with supervisor, HR, employee, union representative (if applicable).
Performance Rating Calibration
How you as a supervisor can create consistency

- Utilize Skills for Success Characteristics of Performance Levels that defines performance ratings
- Create a matrix, like Facilities Engineering’s definition of performance levels, for your department
- Hold rating calibration meetings facilitated by HR - OPTIONAL
March 31, 2013 and each March 31 for subsequent years.

In 2012, only about 25% of reviews were submitted on time.

Supervisors who do not submit completed reviews by the deadline for their staff will negatively impact their SIP; employees will still be eligible for SIP.
Why does the performance review deadline exist?

**Planning Calendar**

**OCTOBER – JANUARY: STRATEGIC PLANNING – ORGANIZATIONAL GOAL SETTING**

1. University, Divisional, and Departmental goal setting and strategic planning sessions happen to determine organizational priorities.

**JANUARY – MARCH: DEPT. RATING CALIBRATION AND INDIVIDUAL PERFORMANCE REVIEWS**

2. Departments discuss performance rating calibrations. Based on University, Divisional, and Departmental goals, individual performance reviews, development plans, and goal setting are conducted.

**APRIL – JUNE: SALARY IMPROVEMENT PROCESS**

3. Based on individual performance evaluations, pay increases are directly correlated to performance within the University’s Salary Improvement Process guidelines. Salary improvement plan increases decided.

**JULY – SEPTEMBER: SUCCESSION PLANNING**

4. Revisit Individual Development Plan with employees and supervisors. Divisional succession planning and developmental discussions happen.
Continuing Improvement Of The Performance Review Process

Spring 2012 - Employee Survey results provide baseline for PD improvement

Summer 2012 - Diversity Council reviews status and plans initiatives

Fall 2012 - Trainings & Expectations document

March 31 2013 - Performance review submission deadline

July 2013 – Salary Improvement Plan increases decided and distributed based on performance review

Late Summer 2013 – Survey asking for feedback about PD process
SCENARIOS EXERCISE
Performance Management Scenario 1

Scenario

1. This performance appraisal was written for an employee who meets expectations. The supervisor has rated every category a 4 or 5 with an overall rating of 5 and did not include any notes/feedback in previous years. Think about an employee you manage who meets expectations and would be rated a 3 this year and how this performance appraisal would be received.

Discussion Questions

2. • Is this performance appraisal an effective means of delivering accurate feedback to an employee? Why or why not?

   • What message does this performance appraisal send to the employee? Could there be any biases influencing your appraisal?

   • If an employee was really performing at the 4 or 5 level, what means of recognition are in place that correspond with a 4 or 5?

   • What kind of feedback can be delivered to an employee who meets expectations to help them improve and grow within your department?
The performance appraisal was written for an employee who has received discipline over the last year for general performance issues but has shown improvement in the last six months.

Discussion Questions

- Since the employee has shown improvement in the last six months do you need to address the attendance issue at this time?
- Should attendance issues be considered work performance? Where on the performance review would you capture attendance feedback (consider union and non-union performance review forms)?
- How do you rate this employee using the performance reviews considering the employee is really good at their job responsibilities?
- How would you rate this employee considering everything?
- Would you discuss the good performance the employee had over the last year?
- Would you discuss the challenges the employee faced over the last year?
Scenario 3

This employee and her supervisor have different perceptions of her performance over the past year. The employee rates herself very highly and has clear aspirations to manage the department in 3 years. Her supervisor needs her to work on a few things, as noted in the performance review.

Discussion Questions

1. How should the employee’s supervisor frame the performance review and discussion to help her understand there are things she needs to work on in order to meet her career goals?

2. How does the employee’s supervisor work with her to help her build awareness of her own performance? What are some tools the employee’s supervisor can use to help?

3. How can the supervisor create a safe environment for feedback? What can the supervisor do himself to encourage growth and development and ensure he is not inhibiting the employee’s career path?

4. With the employee’s career aspirations being the supervisor’s position, what should the supervisor be aware of in terms of his own possible bias?
Scenario

1. An direct report of yours has career goals to develop into a management position. This is the first year the Individual Development Plan has been available to you as the supervisor and the employee as a tool for development. The employee attempts to begin the Individual Development Plan but is not sure how start down their own development path or achieve their goals.

Discussion Questions

2. • How do you help the employee with their career goals?
   • What university resources or external resources can you use to help?
   • How can you best assist the employee in achieving their goals?
Performance Management Scenario 5

You supervise a team of front-line staff who provide essential services to facilities across campus. This year, you would like to work together with your direct reports to set goals. You understand university, division, and department goals and would like individual goals to align to those priorities.

1. How do you help your direct reports set their individual goals?
2. How do you include diversity related goals?
3. How do you monitor progress towards those goals?
4. How do you reward goal completion?
5. Who and how do you communicate goals and progress?
Performance Management Scenario 6

Scenario

1. A cheerful, outgoing employee that has been a consistent high performer for a number of years has suddenly become withdrawn and has not only missed several key deadlines, but is also becoming increasingly absent from work. After several weeks, you discover this employee was the victim of a highly publicized biased incident that occurred off campus, but say nothing to the employee indicating you are aware of this fact. The employee slowly resumes their high performing behavior but is still very guarded and not as outgoing as they once were. It is now time for that employee’s performance review.

Discussion Questions

2. During the performance review, do you bring up the biased incident?

2. Do you address the employee’s work performance during this stressful time?

2. What could you, as a supervisor, have done differently when this high performer was going through an obviously stressful time?

2. What university resources do you offer to this employee?
1. Pay attention to the differences in your employees and making an effort to ensure that all staff succeed according to their talents.

2. Look out for any conscious or subconscious personal biases (back seat/front seat exercise)

3. Recognize employees for their efforts to promote diversity within the community or suggest ways to improve their intercultural competence (skills for success)

4. Consider low cost yet meaningful and timely recognitions

5. Use SIP awards to reward high achievers; do not simply distribute the same amount for all employees.

6. Encourage all employees to grow: Professional development opportunities should not be reserved for high achievers only.
“Why it’s so hard to be fair”
Article by Joel Brockner

- Concept of process fairness
- Involvement in decision making
- Morale and performance booster
- Moral responsibility
- Two-way communication
- Difficult, but honest and straightforward feedback
CAREER DEVELOPMENT RESOURCES

Committees
Special Task Force Teams
Presentations

Stretch Assignments
Cross Training
Community Volunteerism

Position Swapping
Mentor Relationships
Shadowing

Rotational Assignments

What other career development ideas do you have?
HOW YOU CAN CONTRIBUTE TO DIVERSITY GOALS – Sample ideas

• Actively solicit input from a wide variety of people and functions.

• Involve diverse groups in solving problems and developing opportunities.

• Be sensitive to the fact that some people want their differences to be recognized while others do not.

• Give feedback openly and respectfully to those whose different behaviors and values affect their credibility and effectiveness.

• Become a mentor to an individual whose background and experiences are different from your own.

• Broaden your view of diversity beyond just race or gender issues.

• Look at issues and opportunities from others' viewpoints before making decisions.

• Confront people directly about their prejudiced behavior or comments, encouraging a way for them to change without "losing face."

• Challenge organizational policies and practices that may be exclusionary.

• Continually monitor your automatic thoughts and language for unexamined assumptions and stereotypical responses.

Source: http://www.thediversitytoolkit.com/contentpages/sampletool2.htm
Additional ideas forthcoming from Diversity Committee
REWARDS AND RECOGNITION

A meaningful thank you for a job well done

Consider low cost/no cost ideas

Recognize efforts that promote diversity and inclusion

Everyone is motivated differently… Ask your staff what motivates them!

Facilities Services Rewards and Recognition
Low Cost / No Cost Recognition Ideas

- Treat people as they want to be treated.
- Volunteer to do someone’s undesirable task.
- Say thank you.
- Take a department break in honor of someone.
- Serve ice cream cups to employees on a hot day. Manager cooks breakfast on special occasions.
- Have open Q&A over meal to talk about work topics.
- Manager sends personalized birthday cards to everyone in the department.
- Lunch with supervisor.
- Employee development by sending people to conferences or educational development events.
- Acknowledge years of service or a service award by a presentation of a certificate and a meal or small gift certificate.
- Celebrate birthdays as a department with cake and/or card.
- Host a holiday party that includes a meal and/or raffles.
- Host a summer work party.
- Recognize a safe work environment by awarding leave with pay for achieving milestones without injuries or lost work.
- Recognize volunteerism with a bonus, meal, or paid time off.
- Supervisors reward employees with a token free item (gift certificates, movie tickets, golf lessons, etc) from a department treasure chest.
Useful Links

Career Planning Services
Discipline Process
Career Mapping/Rotational Assignment Program
Facilities Services Diversity Initiative
Facilities Performance Management
Facilities Services Job Descriptions
Facilities Services Training Database
Goal Alignment Worksheet
Individual Development Plan (template) (sample
Leadership Development Opportunities
Performance Appraisal (for union staff)
Performance Dialogue (for non-union staff)
Pre-Performance Dialogue (PD) Feedback Questions
Performance Improvement Plan
Rewards and Recognition
Skills for Success Characteristics of Performance Levels
University Performance Management Resources
What to expect during a performance dialogue
THANK YOU!